CHARACTERISTICS OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION MATERIAL TEACHING AND ITS RELEVANCE TO MULTICULTURAL VALUES IN SCHOOLS

Merdi F. Mamonto

Institut Agama Islam Muhammadiyah Kotamobagu Jl. Teuku Umar No. 56, Matali, Kec. Kotamobagu Timur, Kota Kotamobagu e-mail: merdi.fmamonto@iaimkotamobagu.ac.id

Musyarrafah Sulaiman Kurdi

Universitas Islam Negeri Antasari Banjarmasin Jl. A. Yani Km. 4.5, Kec. Banjarmasin Timur, Kota Banjarmasin e-mail: musyarrafah@uin-antasari.ac.id

Aisvatin Kamila

Universitas Ibrahimy Situbondo Jl. KHR. Syamsul Arifin No. 1-2, Sukorejo, Sumberejo, Kec. Banyuputih, Kab. Situbondo e-mail: kamilaisyatin96@gmail.com

Sudarmadi Putra

Sekolah Tinggi Islam Al-Mukmin Surakarta Jl. Jati, Cemani, Kec. Grogol, Kab. Sukoharjo e-mail: sudarmadiputra@stimsurakarta.ac.id

Arkam Lahiya

Institut Agama Islam Muhammadiyah Kotamobagu Jl. Teuku Umar No. 56, Matali, Kec. Kotamobagu Timur, Kota Kotamobagu e-mail: arkamlahiya@iaimkotamobagu.ac.id

Abstrak: Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis karakteristik pengajaran materi pendidikan agama terkait doktrin kebenaran agama (Islam, Kristen, dan Hindu) serta relevansinya dengan nilai-nilai multikultural di SMA Negeri 2 Kotamobagu. Kajian dilakukan untuk menelusuri tipologi hubungan antara doktrin kebenaran agama dalam Islam, Kristen, dan Hindu serta konteks nilai-nilai multikultural tentang pendidikan agama dalam memahami dan menghayati makna nilai-nilai multikultural di lingkungan sekolah. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode deskriptif kualitatif, dan data diperoleh melalui wawancara dengan informan penelitian yaitu guru agama Islam, Kristen, dan Hindu, siswa kelas X, XI, dan XII, serta Kepala Sekolah. Teknik pengumpulan data meliputi observasi, wawancara, dan dokumentasi. Temuan menunjukkan bahwa guru pendidikan agama masih harus secara penuh dan konsisten menerapkan nilai-nilai multikultural dalam praktik pengajarannya. Ajaran tersebut menitikberatkan pada pemahaman pluralisme dan cenderung pada sikap toleransi. Hasil penelitian menyimpulkan bahwa pengajaran materi pendidikan agama yang berkaitan dengan doktrin kebenaran agama telah menunjukkan sinergi dengan nilai-nilai multikultural namun tetap berpusat pada pembinaan sikap toleran antar umat beragama yang berbeda di lingkungan sekolah. Pendidikan agama ini berkontribusi dalam menanamkan pola pikir pluralistik pada siswa sebagai langkah proaktif sebelum potensi konflik muncul.

Abstract: Characteristics of Religious Education Material Teaching and Its Relevance to Multicultural Values in Schools. This research aims to analyze the characteristics of teaching religious education materials related to the doctrines of religious truth (Islam, Christianity, and Hinduism) and its relevance to multicultural values in State Senior High School 2 Kotamobagu. The study is conducted to trace the typology of the relationships between the doctrines of religious truth in Islam, Christianity, and Hinduism and the context of multicultural values concerning religious education in understanding and embracing the meaning of multicultural values within the school environment. The research utilizes a qualitative descriptive method, and data is obtained through interviews with research informants, including Islamic, Christian, and Hindu religion teachers, as well as students from grades X, XI, and XII, and the School Principal. Data collection techniques include observation, interviews, and documentation. The findings reveal that religious education teachers still must fully and consistently implement multicultural values in their teaching practices. The instruction focuses on understanding pluralism and tends towards a tolerance stance. The research concludes that the teaching of religious education material related to the doctrines of religious truth has shown synergy with multicultural values but is still primarily centred around fostering a tolerant attitude among different religious communities within the school. This religious education contributes to instilling a pluralistic mindset in students as a proactive measure before potential conflicts arise.

Keywords: teaching; religious education material; claims of truth; multicultural values

Introduction

Education inherently upholds values and customs,¹ and employs consensus-seeking in finding solutions.² Aspects such as intellectual capitalism and cannibalism ³ favouring only certain individuals or groups, are not the orientations of education. The purpose of education is to be classless,⁴ in line with the concept of multicultural education, which always strives to

¹ Katerin Arias-Ortega and Carlo Previl, "Essential Mapuche Knowledge for an Effective Intercultural School Education: Perspectives of Traditional Educators," *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, June 6, 2023, 1–14, https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2023.2219235.; Divinah Andrew, "The Impact of Globalization on the Traditional Religious Practices and Cultural Values: A Case Study of Kenya," *International Journal of Culture and Religious Studies* 4, no. 2 (July 10, 2023): 1–12, https://doi.org/10.47941/ijcrs.1345.; Gunjan Sharma, Radhika Mittal, and Zayan, "Teacher Education in India's National Education Policy 2020: Knowledge Traditions, Global Discourses and National Regulations," *Contemporary Education Dialogue*, June 26, 2023, https://doi.org/10.1177/09731849231168728.

² Lidia Casado-Ledesma, Isabel Cuevas, and Elena Martín, "Learning Science through Argumentative Synthesis Writing and Deliberative Dialogues: A Comprehensive and Effective Methodology in Secondary Education," *Reading and Writing* 36, no. 4 (April 1, 2023): 965–96, https://doi.org/10.1007/S11145-021-10191-0/FIGURES/4.; Sarah Shi Hui Wong, "Deliberate Erring Improves Far Transfer of Learning More Than Errorless Elaboration and Spotting and Correcting Others' Errors," *Educational Psychology Review* 35, no. 1 (February 7, 2023): 1–34, https://doi.org/10.1007/S10648-023-09739-Z.

³ Nicholas A. B. Kahn, "Gastronomes of the Old School: American Iterations of the Cannibal Idea," in *Interdisciplinary Essays on Cannibalism*, ed. Giulia Champion, 1st ed. (New York: Routledge, 2021), 230–49, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003002154-21.

⁴ Sabil Mokodenseho, "Pendidikan Dan Politik: Gerakan Sarekat Islam Di Sulawesi Utara Periode 1920-1950" (Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, 2020).; Sabil Mokodenseho, *Sisi Lain Gerakan Sarekat Islam Di Sulawesi Utara Periode 1920-1950* (Surabaya: Jakad Media Publishing, 2020).; Sabil Mokodenseho and Arif Zamhari, "The Struggle of Islam and Christianity in the Establishment of Educational Institutions in Bolaang Mongondow, North Sulawesi (1905-1942)," *ULUL ALBAB Jurnal Studi Islam* 22, no. 1 (July 8, 2021): 23–48, https://doi.org/10.18860/ua.v22i1.11760.

Journal of Islamic Education Policy Vol. 8 No. 2 Juli - Desember 2023

mitigate disparities, class, and social jealousy by introducing and promoting harmony among human beings.⁵

Focusing on togetherness is considered to understand the importance of mutual respect and creating a sense of togetherness. However, the education that has been widely discussed is often theoretical. However, what is most crucial is an education that can recognize, accommodate, understand, and respect differences in ethnicity, nationality, and religion. Meanwhile, the discourse on multiculturalism in the context of the Qur'an is about introducing and understanding SARA (ethnicity, religion, race, and inter-group) to comprehend heterogeneity, which is the essence of multicultural education.

North Sulawesi is a region of multi-ethnicity, religion, culture, and language, and even, when viewed from diverse religions, it can be considered a miniature of Indonesia. Such conditions are certainly different from areas inhabited by only one community, as the dynamics and interests of the people within are undoubtedly dynamic and diverse. If not handled seriously, this situation could easily lead to conflicting interests that may result in division and unrest, as seen in some other regions in Indonesia. Such as the conflicting interests that may result in division and unrest, as seen in some other regions in Indonesia.

Muslims are taught not to close themselves off from new terms or concepts from outside Islam, such as multiculturalism, but it is essential to clarify their meanings. If these concepts do not align with Islamic views, they need to be redefined, as done by Islamic preachers in the Archipelago. Suppose the term multiculturalism refers to a set of relevant values that enable learners to coexist harmoniously amidst diversity and exhibit positive behaviour, managing diversity as a strength to achieve Indonesia's progress without obscuring or erasing religious values, self-identity, and cultural aspects, such as the value of "justice," which is defined as the awareness to treat others impartially and without discrimination based on skin colour, social class, ethnicity, religion, economics, gender, etc. In that case, it is in line with Islamic teachings.

⁵ Tesfaye Limoreo Degaga, Yilfashewa Seyoum Mekuria, and Università Degli Studi Di Bari Aldo, "Multicultural Education: Teachers' Perceptions in Hosanna College of Education, Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region (SNNPR), Ethiopia," *Cogent Education* 10, no. 1 (2023): 2184916, https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2023.2184916.; Ge Wang and Fang Gao, "The School-Based Multicultural Education Curriculum in China: A Case Study of Two Yugur Middle Schools," *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 2023, 1–13, https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2023.2166944.; Karta Jayadi, Amirullah Abduh, and Muhammad Basri, "A Meta-Analysis of Multicultural Education Paradigm in Indonesia," *Heliyon* 8, no. 1 (January 1, 2022): e08828, https://doi.org/10.1016/J.HELIYON.2022.E08828.

⁶ Sarah Song, "The Subject of Multiculturalism: Culture, Religion, Language, Ethnicity, Nationality, and Race?," in *New Waves in Political Philosophy* (London: Palgrave Macmillan UK, 2009), 177–97, https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230234994_10.; Robert Jackson, *Rethinking Religious Education and Plurality* (Routledge, 2013), https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203465165.

⁷ Sabil Mokodenseho and Ismail Suardi Wekke, "Toleransi Beragama Dan Pembelajaran Agama Islam: Harmoni Masyarakat Minoritas Muslim Manado," *Prosiding* 1, no. 1 (February 21, 2017): 67–75.; S. Wekke, I. S., & Mokodenseho, "Religious Teaching and Learning in Minority Muslim of Manado Indonesia," in *2nd International Conference on Education, Science, and Technology (ICEST 2017)*, ed. G. D. Dirawan (Atlantis Press, 2017), 187–89, https://doi.org/10.2991/icest-17.2017.62.; Ismail Suardi Wekke, Sabil Mokodenseho, and Firdaus Firdaus, "Religious Education and Tolerance: Learning Process in High School of Minority Muslim Indonesia," 2017, https://doi.org/10.31227/OSF.IO/KM79D.; Ismail Suardi Wekke, Sabil Mokodenseho, and A. Fadzlur Rahman, "Values of Religious Tolerance in Islamic Learning Material of Muslim Minority State High School," 2018, https://doi.org/10.31227/osf.io/tfbkc.

⁸ Eunike Mutiara Himawan, Annie Pohlman, and Winnifred Louis, "Revisiting the May 1998 Riots in Indonesia: Civilians and Their Untold Memories," *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs* 2022, no. 2 (March 9, 2022): 240–57, https://doi.org/10.1177/18681034221084320.; Sarinah Lo, "The Roles of Christian Schools in Mitigating Ethno-Religious Violence in Indonesia," *International Journal of Christianity & Education* 26, no. 3 (January 24, 2022): 300–314, https://doi.org/10.1177/20569971211064993.

Various terms often describe societies of different religions, races, languages, and cultures. Budirahayu and Saud mention several terms like plurality, diversity, and multiculturalism. In this context, van Knippenberg and van Ginkel observe that diversity influences human behaviour, attitudes, and thought patterns, leading to unique ways, habits, rules, and customs that give rise to cultural enculturation and assimilation. Enculturation is learning the values and norms of a culture experienced by an individual throughout their life. On the other hand, cultural assimilation is the process between two or more groups through stages of thinking, mutual tolerance, and action, resulting in each group blending their cultures into a unity. Failure to understand such conditions adequately can lead to friction, ultimately leading to conflicts. This is where the role of multicultural values becomes crucial.

Education is vital in shaping public life and is believed to influence politics and culture significantly. As a medium for preparing and shaping social life, education becomes the foundation of an institution rich in idealistic values. Schools represent a microcosm of society; within them, formal education occurs. In schools, understanding and instilling multicultural values become one of the central means of education.

State Senior High School 2 Kotamobagu is a distinctive school focusing on general education, making it the first choice for the community, especially the people of Kotamobagu. The school has rapidly developed, with well-equipped physical facilities and many students. The learning process here is conducted with wisdom, and religious knowledge is taught to students based on clear foundations. In religious truth, Muslim students use the Qur'an and Hadith, Christian students use the Bible, and Hindu students use the Vedas as the basis for their learning. Students apply and practice the religious theories taught by their religious teachers in their daily lives. The doctrines of religious truth are connected to both worship practices and social relationships within the context of multiculturalism.

The surrounding community of State Senior High School 2 Kotamobagu is diverse in culture, customs, and religions, as reflected in the motto of *Bolaang Mongondow*, which includes *mototompiaan* (mutual correction), *mototabian* (mutual affection), and *bo mototanoban* (mutual remembrance). The philosophy of *mototompiaan* emphasizes care and relationships between individuals, communities, and the government, with a connotation of mutual responsibility for goodness and development. The philosophy of *mototabian* manifests love and affection, both towards God (*Habluminallah*) and fellow human beings (*hablumminannas*) and is epitomized in the concept of "*Torang Samua Basudara*" (We are all brothers and sisters), derived from the *Mongondow* language with the prefix "*mo*" and suffix "*an*," signifying the drive and pressure in terms of understanding and implementation. Suppose *mototabian* represents the implementation of love and affection in the grandeur of

¹⁰ Daan van Knippenberg and Wendy P. van Ginkel, "A Diversity Mindset Perspective on Inclusive Leadership," *Group & Organization Management* 47, no. 4 (April 30, 2022): 779–97, https://doi.org/10.1177/1059601121997229.

¹² Victoria Openif Oluwa Akoleowo, "Tolerance, Multiculturalism and the Search for National Unity," in *Karl Popper and Africa: Knowledge, Politics and Development* (Cham: Springer, 2021), 83–96, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-74214-0_7.

⁹ Tuti Budirahayu and Muhammad Saud, "Proposing an Integrated Multiculturalism Learning System: A Study from Indonesian Schools," *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher* 30, no. 2 (June 22, 2021): 141–52, https://doi.org/10.1007/S40299-020-00521-1.

¹¹ Robert Mirski and Mark H. Bickhard, "Conventional Minds: An Interactivist Perspective on Social Cognition and Its Enculturation," *New Ideas in Psychology* 62 (August 1, 2021): 100856, https://doi.org/10.1016/J.NEWIDEAPSYCH.2021.100856.

¹³ Selviyanti Kaawoan, "The Role of Educators in Fostering Students' Tolerant Behavior at Public High School in Bolaang Mongondow Regency," *European Journal of Humanities and Educational Advancements* (*EJHEA*) 2, no. 12 (2021): 103–5.

God, a step or movement to actualize this love and affection. In that case, *mototanoban* represents the result of *mototompiaan* and *mototabian*, felt as the deepest voice from the heart. The word "*tanob*" with the prefix "*mo*" and the suffix "*an*" conveys a sense of longing.

In line with the ancestral message above, students often interact with the community, particularly peers with diverse cultural, customary, and religious backgrounds. However, these differences sometimes lead to disharmony. Misunderstandings about religion due to students' lack of knowledge can lead to disputes in school interactions. Therefore, this research aims to analyze the patterns of imparting religious doctrines and multicultural values carried out by religious teachers at the school. This study contributes to fostering a pluralistic attitude among students at State Senior High School 2 Kotamobagu, serving as a concept for mapping proactive pluralistic attitudes before conflicts arise in a multicultural society within religious education.

Literature Review

The Doctrine of Truth

Etymologically, "doctrine" in each religious teaching advocates harmony, peace, coexistence, mutual respect, upholding principles of togetherness, and noble values. ¹⁴ However, in the sociological reality of culture, religious doctrines, decisions of the council of scholars, decisions of councils, or the agreements reached in world church assemblies cannot guarantee the realization of these ideals as envisioned by those who propose and advocate them. Many dominant sociocultural "interest" factors, political, social, cultural, or security-related, still influence the struggles, dynamics, and ebbs and flows of interreligious relations. ¹⁵ In certain boundaries, these practical-historical interests seem to render theological doctrines and agreements of world church councils barren, arid, formal, and no longer capable of stirring the conscience of their followers to ignite the spirit of seeking breakthroughs. ¹⁶

The amalgamation of doctrinal-theological elements in sociocultural struggles further complicates religious issues.¹⁷ The intersection of normative doctrines (often grounded in sacred scriptures) with individual or group interpretations of these doctrines (often influenced and mixed with sociocultural interests) is, in many cases, quite challenging to resolve using conventional methods,¹⁸ whether through in-depth and honest study of each religious doctrine or empirical studies typically conducted in the field of religious studies.

¹⁴ Hadi Pajarianto, Imam Pribadi, and Puspa Sari, "Tolerance between Religions through the Role of Local Wisdom and Religious Moderation," *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies* 78, no. 4 (2022), https://doi.org/10.4102/HTS.V78I4.7043.; Muh. Idris et al., "The Implementation of Religious Moderation Values in Islamic Education and Character Subject at State Senior High School 9 Manado," *Academy of Strategic Management Journal* 20, no. 6 (2021): 1–16.;

¹⁵ Douglas Pratt and Charles L. Tieszen, "Christians, Muslims and the True Religion," *Christian-Muslim Relations*. *A Bibliographical History Volume 15 Thematic Essays* (600-1600), April 17, 2020, 73–97, https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004423701_005.; Patrick Barron, Sana Jaffrey, and Ashutosh Varshney, "When Large Conflicts Subside: The Ebbs and Flows of Violence in Post-Suharto Indonesia," *Journal of East Asian Studies* 16, no. 2 (July 1, 2016): 191–217, https://doi.org/10.1017/JEA.2016.6.; Mokodenseho and Wekke, "Toleransi Beragama Dan Pembelajaran Agama Islam: Harmoni Masyarakat Minoritas Muslim Manado."

¹⁶ Michael Jinkins, *Invitation to Theology: A Guide to Study, Conversation & Practice* (InterVarsity Press, 2015).

¹⁷ Karimatul Hasanah, "Toward an Objective Islamic Studies," *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 5, no. 1 (June 19, 2016): 1–10, https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v5i1.1713.

¹⁸ Andrew F. March, "Political Islam: Theory," *Annual Reviews* 18 (May 11, 2015): 103–23, https://doi.org/10.1146/ANNUREV-POLISCI-082112-141250.

Many experts state that knowledge consists of rational, ¹⁹ moral, ²⁰ sensory, ²¹ authoritative, and intuitive knowledge. ²² According to the author, the correct understanding is that rational knowledge is called logic, moral knowledge is called ethics, and sensory knowledge is called aesthetics. On the other hand, authoritative knowledge is referred to as faith, called religion (but not authoritative) because religion does not impose, and it must be accepted logically, ethically, and aesthetically.

Multicultural Values

Etymologically, multicultural is an English term derived from two words, "multi" and "culture." Generally, "multi" means many, diverse, or varied, while "culture" refers to culture, politeness, and preservation. ²³ In terminology, multiculturalism can be divided into two categories. First, it is the political aspect of life built on principles of democracy, equality, and justice. Second, is the diversity aspect of life built on social attitudes of recognition, acceptance, and appreciation. ²⁴

Multicultural values concerning multicultural education involve the development of human potential that embraces pluralism and heterogeneity due to cultural, ethnic, religious, economic, social, and political diversity. ²⁵ As one of the world's largest multicultural countries, Indonesia should actively promote multicultural education as an alternative to prevent social and cultural conflicts that often occur in the countrya. ²⁶ Building a multicultural society in Indonesia cannot be taken for granted or done through trial and error; instead, it must be approached systematically, programmatically, integrated, and continuously. This is because Indonesia's multicultural reality is a cultural richness and strength that should be preserved and protected. ²⁷

Multicultural education in Indonesia should develop a learning model focusing on several fundamental competencies citizens must possess. Firstly, it should develop academic competencies in standard and foundational values of unity, democracy, justice, freedom, equality, and mutual respect amidst diverse forms of diversity.²⁸ Secondly, it should foster

¹⁹ John Heeren, "Alfred Schutz and the Sociology of Common-Sense Knowledge," in *Everyday Life: Reconstruction of Social Knowledge* (Taylor and Francis, 2017), 45–56, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351327329-2

²⁰ Ángel García Rodríguez, "A Wittgensteinian View of Mind and Self-Knowledge," *Philosophia (United States)* 48, no. 3 (July 1, 2020): 993–1013, https://doi.org/10.1007/S11406-019-00143-Y/METRICS.

²¹ Paulius Rimkevičius, "The Interpretive-Sensory Access Theory of Self-Knowledge: Empirical Adequacy and Scientific Fruitfulness," *Problemos*, no. 97 (2020): 150–63.

²² Arnon Keren, "Trust, Preemption, and Knowledge," in *Trust in Epistemology* (Taylor and Francis, 2019), 114–35, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351264884-5.

²³ Manuela Guilherme and Gunther Dietz, "Difference in Diversity: Multiple Perspectives on Multicultural, Intercultural, and Transcultural Conceptual Complexities," *Journal of Multicultural Discourses* 10, no. 1 (January 2, 2015): 1–21, https://doi.org/10.1080/17447143.2015.1015539.

²⁴ François Levrau and Patrick Loobuyck, "Introduction: Mapping the Multiculturalism-Interculturalism Debate," *Comparative Migration Studies* 6, no. 1 (December 1, 2018): 13, https://doi.org/10.1186/S40878-018-0080-8.

²⁵ Mukh Nursikin et al., "Multicultural Based Islamic Religious Education In Indonesia," *At-Tarbiyat : Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 5, no. 3 (2022): 468–75, https://doi.org/10.37758/JAT.V5I3.492.

²⁶ Heri Susanto, "Perception on Cultural Diversity and Multiculturalism Education," in *Proceedings of the 1st International Conference on Social Sciences Education - "Multicultural Transformation in Education, Social Sciences and Wetland Environment" (ICSSE 2017)* (Atlantis Press, 2017), 125–29, https://doi.org/10.2991/ICSSE-17.2018.30.

²⁷ Muhammad Hifdil Islam, "Diversity and Multicultural," *Humanistika* 3, no. 1 (2017): 83–103.

²⁸ Candra Cuga, "Civic Education as Vehicle of Multicultural Education in Building Democratic Citizen," in *Proceedings of the Annual Civic Education Conference (ACEC 2018)* (Atlantis Press, 2018), 160–67, https://doi.org/10.2991/ACEC-18.2018.40.

social competencies to nurture a better understanding of one's cultural and religious background and the cultures and religions of others in society.²⁹ Thirdly, it should cultivate academic competencies to analyze and make informed decisions about daily issues and problems through democratic and dialogic processes.³⁰ Lastly, it should aid in conceptualizing and aspiring to construct a better, democratic, egalitarian society free from discrimination, oppression, and violations of universal values.³¹

Hernandez defines *multicultural education* as a perspective that recognizes the political, social, and economic realities experienced by individuals in complex and diverse human interactions concerning culture and reflects the significance of culture, race, sexuality, gender, ethnicity, religion, social status, economic and political factors, and exceptions within the educational process.³² This perspective implies that the space of multicultural education, as a medium of knowledge transformation, should be capable of imparting multicultural values that respect and honour diverse realities (pluralism), including their backgrounds and social-cultural foundations. This perspective aligns with the following Quranic verse:

"O mankind, indeed We have created you from male and female and made you peoples and tribes that you may know one another. Indeed, the most noble of you in the sight of Allah is the most righteous of you. Indeed, Allah is Knowing and Acquainted" (Q.S. Al-Hujurat [49]: 13).

In the context of multicultural education, Azra outlines three perspectives on understanding multicultural education.³³ Firstly, multicultural education is a philosophical concept based on freedom, justice, equality, the right to prosperity, and human dignity. Secondly, it is viewed as a process encompassing all aspects of school practice, policies, and organizations to ensure students' academic achievements. Thirdly, multicultural education reinforces the belief that all students, their life stories, and experiences should be at the centre of the teaching process, and learning should be based on contexts familiar to students and exhibit various ways of thinking.

Masamah and Huda state that multicultural issues still pose a threat to Indonesia. Tragic events have occurred in several regions caused by religious, cultural, ethnic, or tribal differences.³⁴ The diversity in this country still has the potential to trigger conflicts in the form

³⁰ Glenn A. Bowen, "Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method," *Qualitative Research Journal* 9, no. 2 (2009): 27–40, https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027/FULL/XML.

³³ Azyumardi Azra, "Pendidikan Kewargaan Dan Demokrasi Di Indonesia," in *Pendidikan Untuk Masyarakat Indonesia Baru: 70 Tahun HAR Tilaar*, ed. Ikhwanuddin Syarif and Domodo Murtadlo (Jakarta: Grasinda, 2002), 13.

²⁹ Manivong J. Ratts et al., "Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competencies: Guidelines for the Counseling Profession," *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development* 44, no. 1 (January 2016): 28–48, https://doi.org/10.1002/jmcd.12035.

³¹ Carlos Alberto Torres and Massimiliano Tarozzi, "Multiculturalism in the World System: Towards a Social Justice Model of Inter/Multicultural Education," *Globalisation, Societies and Education* 18, no. 1 (January 1, 2020): 7–18, https://doi.org/10.1080/14767724.2019.1690729.

³² Hilda Hernandez, *Multicultural Education: A Teacher's Guide to Linking Context Process, and Content* (Prentice Hall, 2001).

³⁴ Firdaus Firdaus, Dian Kurnia Anggreta, and Faishal Yasin, "Internalizing Multiculturalism Values Through Education: Anticipatory Strategies for Multicultural Problems and Intolerance in Indonesia," Jurnal Sosial Budaya Antropologi: Isu-Isu 22, no. (May 2020): https://doi.org/10.25077/JANTRO.V22.N1.P131-141.2020.; Habib Zarbaliyev, "Multiculturalism Globalization Era: History and Challenge for Indonesia," Journal of Social Studies (JSS) 13, no. 1 (November 21, 2017): 1–16, https://doi.org/10.21831/JSS.V13I1.16966.

of violence, attacks, destruction, arson, persecution, arrests, and intimidation. The multicultural issues reflected in these events are social products known as habitus, a form of conditioning tied to the existence of a social class, namely the dominant class holding power.³⁵ Conditioning can be carried out through mass media and education. These elements are seen as effective means to disseminate discourse.

Multicultural education is necessary to prevent differences from threatening national unity. Efforts towards positive conditioning through education are needed. Policies based on a more critical approach to multiculturalism must be immediately discussed, designed, and implemented. To avoid the negative impacts of social conditions in Indonesia, a suitable education model based on multiculturalism must be developed, practised, and refined to address challenges. The ultimate goal of education is to deliberately and systematically create a learning environment where students can actively develop their potential. Therefore, students will possess spiritual strength, self-discipline, personality, intelligence, noble morals, and necessary skills for themselves, the community, the nation, and the country.

Educational activities are essential for nurturing multicultural wisdom and global awareness in students, enabling them to play a role in preserving and harnessing diversity for the collective welfare and effectively responding to the forces of globalization. Multicultural values can be implemented in schools through various means.

Firstly, the value of inclusivity. This value acknowledges that other groups hold one group's truths and recognizes pluralism within a community or social group.³⁶ The principle of inclusivity leads to the growth of sensitivity towards the various unique possibilities. Secondly, the value of prioritizing active dialogue. Through dialogue, different understandings of a certain matter held by different groups can be deepened without harming any party involved. The result of prioritizing dialogue is a close relationship, an attitude of mutual understanding, respect, trust, and mutual assistance.³⁷ Thirdly, the value of humanism. Humanism fundamentally entails the recognition of human pluralism, heterogeneity, and diversity.³⁸ This diversity can include ideologies, religions, paradigms, ethnicities, thought patterns, needs, economic levels, etc. Fourthly, the value of tolerance. In communal living, tolerance embodies recognizing and respecting human rights.³⁹ This includes freedom of

³⁶ Daniela Silva and Sofia Marques da Silva, "Policies and Practices on Intercultural Education in Portuguese Schools," *Intercultural Education* 33, no. 5 (2022): 509–25, https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2022.2122173.; Remiswal Remiswal et al., "Religious Education for Schools Within Conflict-Prone Zones: An Inclusive Multicultural Approach," *Journal of Innovation in Educational and Cultural Research* 3, no. 3 (May 11, 2022): 412–21, https://doi.org/10.46843/JIECR.V3I3.127.

³⁷ Clare Merlin-Knoblich, Taryne M. Mingo, and Rachel Saunders, "An Exploration of School Counselor Small Group Work Experiences Leading Diversity Dinner Dialogues," *The Journal for Specialists in Group Work* 47, no. 2 (2022): 133–50, https://doi.org/10.1080/01933922.2021.1950878.; Clare Merlin-Knoblich, C. Missy Moore, and Merry Leigh Dameron, "Examining the Impact of a Diversity Dinner Dialogue Led by School Counselors on Student and Faculty Multicultural Attitudes," *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development* 51, no. 2 (April 1, 2023): 92–103, https://doi.org/10.1002/JMCD.12240.

³⁸ Amrina Amrina et al., "The Implementation of Multicultural Values in Arabic Learning," *Izdihar: Journal of Arabic Language Teaching, Linguistics, and Literature* 5, no. 3 (December 31, 2022): 237–50, https://doi.org/10.22219/JIZ.V513.21914.; Made Saihu et al., "Multicultural Education Based on Religiosity to Enhance Social Harmonization within Students: A Study in a Public Senior High School," *Pegem Journal of Education and Instruction* 12, no. 3 (July 3, 2022): 265–74, https://doi.org/10.47750/PEGEGOG.12.03.28.

³⁹ Alessandro Bergamaschi et al., "Blatant and Subtle Prejudice, and the Role of Teachers in Conveying Tolerance and Respect for the Other," *Intercultural Education* 33, no. 1 (2022): 17–34,

89

³⁵ R. Raihani, "Education for Multicultural Citizens in Indonesia: Policies and Practices," *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education* 48, no. 6 (November 2, 2017): 992–1009, https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2017.1399250.; Firdaus, Anggreta, and Yasin, "Internalizing Multiculturalism Values Through Education: Anticipatory Strategies for Multicultural Problems and Intolerance in Indonesia."

belief, freedom of thought or expression, and freedom of assembly. Fifth the value of mutual assistance. Humans are social beings who cannot live in isolation despite possessing everything they need. Sixth, the value of justice (democratic). Justice is a comprehensive term encompassing all forms of cultural, political, and social justice. Eventh, the values of national and international equality and brotherhood.

In Islam, these concepts are known as ukhuwah, including *ukhuwah islamiah*, *ukhuwah wathaniyyah*, and *ukhuwah bashariyah*.⁴² From the concept of ukhuwah, every human being, regardless of ethnic, religious, national, and belief differences, is considered a sibling and possesses equal rights

Method

This study is field research using an exploratory qualitative method to gather new information that is not stored in previous narratives and to obtain critical analytical power regarding the context of events based on empirical realities. The research approach combines sociological-anthropological and structural-functional perspectives. The sociological-anthropological approach is used because religion, besides being a system of beliefs, is also a social phenomenon. On the other hand, the structural-functional approach, developed by Parsons, analyses factors that reinforce relations based on the theory of inter-subjectivity anatomy.

Primary data for this research was collected through interviews, while books, journal articles, and relevant literature served as secondary data. The non-participant observation technique was used to obtain primary and secondary data, ⁴⁶ on the doctrines of truth claims and multicultural values in religious education. Structured interviews were conducted to gather primary data ⁴⁷ from the school principal, Islamic, Christian, and Hindu religious teachers and students from those faiths at State Senior High School 2 Kotamobagu. Finally,

https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2021.2017643.; Jayadi, Abduh, and Basri, "A Meta-Analysis of Multicultural Education Paradigm in Indonesia."

⁴⁰ Jayadi, Abduh, and Basri, "A Meta-Analysis of Multicultural Education Paradigm in Indonesia."; Mohamad Kholil, "Multicultural Education According to Azyumardi Azra's Perspective," *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research* 05, no. 04 (April 29, 2022): 1518–22, https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v5-i4-43.

⁴¹ Fella Lahmar et al., "Contribution of Islamic Religious Education to Intercultural Values in Pluralistic European Cultures: Insights from Bosnia and Herzegovina," *Religions* 14, no. 4 (March 28, 2023): 453, https://doi.org/10.3390/REL14040453.

⁴² Mukani Mukani, "Islamic Religious Education Subject to Strengthen Harmonization in National Life: A Case at a Multicultural School," *Tadibia Islamika* 2, no. 1 (June 24, 2022): 11–22, https://doi.org/10.28918/TADIBIA.V2I1.5383.; Ardillah Abu, Ismail Suardi Wekke, and Sabil Mokodenseho, "Pandangan Muhammad Jusuf Kalla Dalam Moderasi Beragama," *Journal Mistar* 1, no. 1 (2020): 32–42.

⁴³ John Gerring, "Qualitative Methods," *Annual Review of Political Science* 20 (May 11, 2017): 15–36, https://doi.org/10.1146/ANNUREV-POLISCI-092415-024158.

⁴⁴ Victor T. King, "A Sociological-Anthropological Gaze on Changing Perspectives on Southeast Asia: Personal Interventions in Discipline and Area," *Asia in Transition* 12 (2021): 75–90, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-2438-4_4.

⁴⁵ Talcott Parsons, "The Present Status of 'Structural-Functional' Theory in Sociology," in *The Idea of Social Structure: Papers in Honor of Robert K. Merton*, ed. Lewis A. Coser, 1st ed. (Routledge, 2017), 67–84, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315132563-5.

⁴⁶ Louis Cohen, Lawrence Manion, and Keith Morrison, "Observation," in *Research Methods in Education*, 8th ed. (New York: Routledge, 2017), 542–62, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315456539-26.

⁴⁷ Claire Anderson and Susan Kirkpatrick, "Narrative Interviewing," *International Journal of Clinical Pharmacy* 38, no. 3 (November 27, 2015): 631–34, https://doi.org/10.1007/S11096-015-0222-0.

documentation was used to collect relevant data⁴⁸ from books, journal articles, and other sources. Both primary and secondary data were analyzed inductively, where the process starts from facts and moves towards theories to avoid data manipulation in the research.⁴⁹ The data analysis technique of this study follows the model proposed by Miles and Huberman, which includes data collection, data reduction, data display, and conclusion.⁵⁰

Results and Discussion

Teaching Characteristics of Religious Education Materials in Schools

Regarding textual doctrine, Muslims will sincerely state that the first word uttered by a Muslim when meeting someone else is "assalamu alaikum," ⁵¹ as Islam is a religion of peace. ⁵² Christians claim that their religion is a religion of love through the teachings of Diakonia. ⁵³ Hindus state that their religion emphasizes Darma. ⁵⁴ In terms of conception, they all refer to the same point and goal: peace and harmony. ⁵⁵

The material related to the doctrines of truth in State Senior High School 2 Kotamobagu can be observed in the table of interpreted results and the orientation of multicultural understanding.

Table 1.
Characteristics of Teaching Religious Education Material
Related to Doctrines of Truth

Informant	Statement	Multicultural Orientation
Islamic Religious	For you, your religion, and for me, my	Negative
Education Teacher	religion. This material has been taught in the	
	class so that students can understand Islam as	
	a mercy to all, "rahmatan lil alamin".	
Muslim Student	This material is taught in our class so that we	Negative
	can understand our religion's teachings, which	
	prioritize the truth of Islam, aiming for	

⁴⁸ Judy Brown, "Democracy, Sustainability and Dialogic Accounting Technologies: Taking Pluralism Seriously," *Critical Perspectives on Accounting* 20, no. 3 (April 1, 2009): 313–42, https://doi.org/10.1016/J.CPA.2008.08.002.

⁴⁹ Satu Elo and Helvi Kyngäs, "The Qualitative Content Analysis Process," *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 62, no. 1 (April 1, 2008): 107–15, https://doi.org/10.1111/J.1365-2648.2007.04569.X.

⁵⁰ M. B. Miles and A. M. Huberman, *Qualitative Data Analysis*, II (Newbury Park, CA.: SAGE Publications Inc., 1994).

⁵¹ Noorhaidi Hasan, "The Making of Public Islam: Piety, Agency, and Commodification on the Landscape of the Indonesian Public Sphere," *Contemporary Islam* 3, no. 3 (October 24, 2009): 229–50, https://doi.org/10.1007/S11562-009-0096-9.

⁵² Muh Idris et al., "Peace Resolution in Education and Application on Information and Communication Technologhy," *International Journal of Advanced Science and Technology* 29, no. 6 (2020): 3349–3358, http://sersc.org/journals/index.php/IJAST/article/view/14076.

⁵³ John S. Klaasen, "Diakonia and Diaconal Church," *Missionalia* 48, no. 1 (2020): 120–33, https://doi.org/10.7832/48-1-363.

⁵⁴ Julius Lipner, "The Truth of Dharma and the Dharma of Truth: Reflections on Hinduism as a Dharmic Faith," *International Journal of Hindu Studies* 23, no. 3 (December 7, 2019): 213–37, https://doi.org/10.1007/S11407-019-09262-3.; Veena R. Howard, "Nonviolence in the Dharma Traditions: Hinduism, Jainism, and Buddhism," in *The Routledge Handbook of Pacifism and Nonviolence*, ed. Andrew Fiala, 1st ed. (Routledge, 2018), 80–92, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315638751-8.

⁵⁵ Muhammad Zaman Naz, Abdur Rashid Qadri, and Farman Ali, "The Role of Religion in Establishing Peaceful Coexistence in Society," *Journal of Islamic Thought and Civilization* 8, no. 2 (October 2, 2018): 163–82, https://doi.org/10.32350/jitc.

Journal of Islamic Education Policy Vol. 8 No. 2 Juli - Desember 2023

	students to understand the meaning of truth according to our religion.	
Christian Religious	Every religion teaches its doctrines. However,	Neutral
Education Teacher	we do not overlook other religions in the	
	school because the Bible teaches about	
	religious freedom, so religions outside	
	Christianity should be respected and accepted	
	without blaming each other.	
Christian Student	In Every religion class, Christian students	Neutral
	immediately leave the class because we are a	
	minority, and we directly contact the Christian	
	religious education teacher.	
Hindu Religious	Each student, practices their worship	Neutral
Education Teacher	according to their religion, so there is no	
	element of hatred or blasphemy towards other	
	religions.	
Hindu Student	The Hindu religious education teacher, gives	Positive
	us the perspective that we should understand	
	other religions in Hinduism. However, we	
	remain committed to Hinduism and follow the	
	taught material well.	

The table above shows that the teaching materials related to the doctrine of truth have been taught by the Islamic religious education teacher following the teachings of Islam without offending other religions (Christianity and Hinduism). However, the doctrine of truth and its orientation towards multicultural values seem less open. On the other hand, the Christian religious education teacher demonstrates openness to other religions, thus aligning with multicultural values in Christian religious education. Similarly, the Hindu religious education teacher shows openness in teaching the doctrine of truth concerning multicultural values in the learning process. Therefore, the religious education material, which consists of a series of learning activities related to the doctrine of truth taught in Sekolah Menengah Atas Negeri 2 Kotamobagu, must be designed to achieve educational goals. In this context, a method is needed to ensure that educational goals are optimally achieved.

Regarding internal factors, the student's level of absorption in understanding the material taught by the religious education teacher based on the existing curriculum is unevenly distributed. Thus, active synchronization between teachers and students in delivering the teaching material on the doctrine of truth and multicultural values is necessary. As for external factors, teachers play a role in assessing and instilling character in students. Character cultivation can be achieved through general dialogue activities, as dialogue fosters a deeper understanding of different perspectives among various groups without harming others. Essentially, prioritizing dialogue fosters strong relationships, mutual understanding, respect, trust, and cooperation. In the school environment, both teachers and students consistently practice tolerance. This aspect facilitates students' ease in applying the taught material.

Teaching Practices of Religious Education and Their Relevance to Multicultural Values

Students' understanding enlightens society in the process of social interaction. This means that religious education has a mission to bring students closer to their respective religions' guidance and transform inclusive-multicultural religious values. Religious education should be "dialogized" so that its educational activities can nurture the growth of students' multicultural wisdom and global perspective. Thus, schools become a space to eliminate

prejudice and, at the same time, train and build students' characters to be democratic, humanistic, and pluralistic. At least two things must be done to develop multicultural education in schools. First, engage in dialogue by placing each civilization and culture equally. Second, develop tolerance to provide opportunities for mutual understanding among different cultures. Tolerance here is at the conceptual level and in its operational techniques.

Religious teachers have taught materials on multiculturalism and the doctrine of religious truth in learning at school. However, this practice is limited to students from their respective religions. The following table illustrates the relevance of teaching the doctrine of religious truth with multicultural understanding in Islam, Christianity, and Hinduism at Sekolah Menengah Atas Negeri 2 Kotamobagu.

Table 2.
Relevance of Teaching the Doctrine of Religious Truth with
Multicultural Understanding in Islam, Christianity, and Hinduism

Muticultur	at Understanding in Islam, Christianity, and Hind	
Aspect	Findings	Multicultural Orientation
Relevance of teaching the doctrine of truth with multicultural understanding in Islam, Christianity, and Hinduism.	According to the Islamic Religious Education teacher, there are no doctrines taught by Islamic religious teachers to other religions such as Christianity and Hinduism. The relationship between religious teachers and students from different religions is good, especially with recognized religions.	Neutral
	According to Muslim students, their relationship with students from Christian and Hindu backgrounds is normal, and there are no doctrines among students of different religions. Students respect and care for each other.	Neutral
	According to the Christian Religious Education teacher, students' receptiveness in learning related to this subject shows a good understanding of multicultural perspectives. If this material is taught consistently over the years, the values of togetherness among students from different religions will be instilled.	Neutral
	According to Christian students, their relationship with Muslim and Hindu students is good, and there is no interference, making them feel comfortable. This relationship is maintained due to a tolerant attitude that strengthens togetherness amidst differences.	Neutral
	According to the Hindu Religious Education teacher, there have been no issues with Islamic and Christian religious teachers.	Neutral
	According to Hindu students, they have a good and friendly relationship with Muslim and Christian students.	Neutral

The table above shows that teaching the doctrines of religious truth is in synergy with multicultural understanding among students of Islam, Christianity, and Hinduism. Additionally, there is awareness among teachers to interact with each other, resulting in cooperation in every religious activity within the school environment. This aligns with Azra's three perspectives on multicultural education. First, multicultural education is a philosophical concept based on the ideas of freedom, justice, equality, ownership, and human dignity. Second, multicultural education is a process that encompasses all aspects of school practices, policies, and organizations as tools to ensure students' academic achievements. Third, multicultural education reinforces the belief that all learners, life histories, and experiences should be placed at the centre of the teaching-learning process, which must be based on contexts familiar to the learners and demonstrate diverse ways of thinking.⁵⁶

As for the relationship among students of different religions in the school, there is no available data to present their understanding of religious truth from multicultural perspectives, so it needs to be adjusted according to the level of students' application and understanding. Discussing, designing, and implementing educational policies based on a new, more critical multicultural format is necessary. To avoid negative impacts in today's schools, designing, developing, and implementing an appropriate multicultural-based educational model to address the challenges is essential. Education is a deliberate and planned effort to create a learning environment in which students can actively develop their potential. Thus, students will possess spiritual strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble character, and the necessary skills for themselves, society, the nation, and the country.

Educational activities are required to nurture multicultural wisdom and global awareness among students, enabling them to play a role in cherishing diversity and utilizing it for the well-being of their lives. Student understanding provides enlightenment to society in the process of social interaction. This means religious education has a crucial mission of bringing students closer to the guidance of religion and transforming inclusive-multicultural religious values to them. Belle and Ward argue that religious education should be more "dialogical" to nourish the growth of multicultural wisdom and global perspectives among students.⁵⁷

From the above explanation, it is understood that the implementation of teaching the doctrines of religious truth in synergy with multicultural perspectives in schools is closely related to the cultural values within the school. As a result, teachers and students continuously get to know each other with their respective cultures, creating multicultural values within the school environment. This statement is consistent with Hidayat's view that culture can be learned as a symbol, a shared possession, an individual attribute, a model, and something adaptive. Multicultural awareness is also driven by the development or flow of globalization, which significantly impacts cross-cultural and cross-religious encounters.

The application of cultural values will be more directed through the educational process in schools, as education serves as the basis for moral-spiritual values, which can provide a solution to the impacts of globalization. The concept of multicultural-religious education is a combination of the concept of multicultural education, which emphasizes respect for diversity, with the concept of religious education, which emphasizes an attitude of submission and obedience to Allah's commands. This combination is expected to give rise to an education that can produce human beings who are both humanistic and religious.

⁵⁶ Azra, "Pendidikan Kewargaan Dan Demokrasi Di Indonesia."

⁵⁷ Thomas J. La Belle and Christopher R. Ward, *Multiculturalism and Education: Diversity and Its Impact on Schools and Society* (United States: State University of New York Press, 1994).

In the context of public schools, multicultural education is expected to eliminate stereotypes, selfish attitudes, individualism, and exclusivity among students. The paradigm of multicultural education is continuously conditioned towards fostering a comprehensive view of others, acknowledging that one's existence cannot be separated or integrated from the surrounding environment, which in reality consists of ethnic, rationalistic, religious, cultural, and other diversities.

Multicultural values related to the doctrines of religious truth have been implemented in Sekolah Menengah Atas Negeri 2 Kotamobagu through the school's curriculum guidelines. The concept of "to each, their religion" has been taught at the school, and students have diligently understood the material. Teachers have conducted the teaching process based on the school's guidelines, using the K-2013 Curriculum. The school should engage in open dialogue as a form of socialization among different religions so teachers and students can practice tolerance and understanding pluralism.

Multicultural values related to the doctrines of religious truth in Sekolah Menengah Atas Negeri 2 Kotamobagu have been implemented through the school's curriculum guidelines. However, the school needs to engage in open dialogue to provide socialization among different religions so that teachers and students can practice tolerance and understand pluralism. Additionally, religious teachers must collaborate with teachers of Civics (PPKN) and Social Studies (IPS) in teaching practices to successfully implement multicultural values in the school.

Conclusion

The multicultural values in religious education related to the doctrines of truth are still at the level of understanding pluralism in practising religions and tend to lean towards tolerance. Implementing multicultural values in religious education concerning the doctrines of truth has not been deep and uniform. While teaching the doctrines of religious truth has synergized with the multicultural perspective across religions, it is limited to the application of tolerance among religious communities.

This conclusion implies that the application of multicultural values in religious education related to the doctrines of truth in schools should be consistently implemented by teachers so that students can understand the significance of multicultural values. Additionally, open dialogue in schools can provide religious insights to students in appreciating differences within the school environment, increasing awareness among students in practising their religions and engaging enthusiastically in the learning process.

This research recommends several actions. Firstly, each teacher, especially religion teachers, should implement student-centred teaching, collaborating with teachers of Civic Education (PPKN) and Social Studies (IPS), using various teaching techniques and styles to prevent students from getting bored and to facilitate their understanding of the multicultural values in religious education concerning the doctrines of truth at school. Secondly, teachers need to conduct open dialogues in school, focusing on the three religions (Islam, Christian, and Hindu) led by teachers of Islamic, Christian, and Hindu Education, along with the support of other teachers, to provide students with a broad understanding of each religion's beliefs, fostering a tolerant attitude in understanding differences in school and nurturing these values as universal strengths in comprehending multicultural values. Thirdly, the school principal is expected to set a good example for the entire school community, particularly for teachers, in how to implement diverse teaching methods and enhance cooperation between teachers, the school, and the community to improve the teaching of religious truths while synergizing with the multicultural values present within the school environment and society at large.

References

- Abu, Ardillah, Ismail Suardi Wekke, and Sabil Mokodenseho. "Pandangan Muhammad Jusuf Kalla Dalam Moderasi Beragama." *Journal Mistar* 1, no. 1 (2020): 32–42.
- Akoleowo, Victoria Openif Oluwa. "Tolerance, Multiculturalism and the Search for National Unity." In *Karl Popper and Africa: Knowledge, Politics and Development*, 83–96. Cham: Springer, 2021. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-74214-0_7.
- Amrina, Amrina, Zulmuqim Zulmuqim, Iswantir Iswantir, Adam Mudinillah, and Ahmad Firdaus Mohd Noor. "The Implementation of Multicultural Values in Arabic Learning." *Izdihar: Journal of Arabic Language Teaching, Linguistics, and Literature* 5, no. 3 (December 31, 2022): 237–50. https://doi.org/10.22219/JIZ.V5I3.21914.
- Anderson, Claire, and Susan Kirkpatrick. "Narrative Interviewing." *International Journal of Clinical Pharmacy* 38, no. 3 (November 27, 2015): 631–34. https://doi.org/10.1007/S11096-015-0222-0.
- Andrew, Divinah. "The Impact of Globalization on the Traditional Religious Practices and Cultural Values: A Case Study of Kenya." *International Journal of Culture and Religious Studies* 4, no. 2 (July 10, 2023): 1–12. https://doi.org/10.47941/ijcrs.1345.
- Arias-Ortega, Katerin, and Carlo Previl. "Essential Mapuche Knowledge for an Effective Intercultural School Education: Perspectives of Traditional Educators." *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, June 6, 2023, 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2023.2219235.
- Azra, Azyumardi. "Pendidikan Kewargaan Dan Demokrasi Di Indonesia." In *Pendidikan Untuk Masyarakat Indonesia Baru: 70 Tahun HAR Tilaar*, edited by Ikhwanuddin Syarif and Domodo Murtadlo, 13. Jakarta: Grasinda, 2002.
- Barron, Patrick, Sana Jaffrey, and Ashutosh Varshney. "When Large Conflicts Subside: The Ebbs and Flows of Violence in Post-Suharto Indonesia." *Journal of East Asian Studies* 16, no. 2 (July 1, 2016): 191–217. https://doi.org/10.1017/JEA.2016.6.
- Belle, Thomas J. La, and Christopher R. Ward. *Multiculturalism and Education: Diversity and Its Impact on Schools and Society*. United States: State University of New York Press, 1994.
- Bergamaschi, Alessandro, Catherine Blaya, Francesco Arcidiacono, and Jimmy Steff. "Blatant and Subtle Prejudice, and the Role of Teachers in Conveying Tolerance and Respect for the Other." *Intercultural Education* 33, no. 1 (2022): 17–34. https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2021.2017643.
- Bowen, Glenn A. "Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method." *Qualitative Research Journal* 9, no. 2 (2009): 27–40. https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027/FULL/XML.
- Brown, Judy. "Democracy, Sustainability and Dialogic Accounting Technologies: Taking Pluralism Seriously." *Critical Perspectives on Accounting* 20, no. 3 (April 1, 2009): 313–42. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.CPA.2008.08.002.
- Budirahayu, Tuti, and Muhammad Saud. "Proposing an Integrated Multiculturalism Learning System: A Study from Indonesian Schools." *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher* 30, no. 2 (June 22, 2021): 141–52. https://doi.org/10.1007/S40299-020-00521-1.
- Casado-Ledesma, Lidia, Isabel Cuevas, and Elena Martín. "Learning Science through Argumentative Synthesis Writing and Deliberative Dialogues: A Comprehensive and Effective Methodology in Secondary Education." *Reading and Writing* 36, no. 4 (April 1, 2023): 965–96. https://doi.org/10.1007/S11145-021-10191-0/FIGURES/4.
- Cohen, Louis, Lawrence Manion, and Keith Morrison. "Observation." In *Research Methods in Education*, 8th ed., 542–62. New York: Routledge, 2017. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315456539-26.
- Cuga, Candra. "Civic Education as Vehicle of Multicultural Education in Building

- Democratic Citizen." In *Proceedings of the Annual Civic Education Conference (ACEC 2018)*, 160–67. Atlantis Press, 2018. https://doi.org/10.2991/ACEC-18.2018.40.
- Elo, Satu, and Helvi Kyngäs. "The Qualitative Content Analysis Process." *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 62, no. 1 (April 1, 2008): 107–15. https://doi.org/10.1111/J.1365-2648.2007.04569.X.
- Firdaus, Firdaus, Dian Kurnia Anggreta, and Faishal Yasin. "Internalizing Multiculturalism Values Through Education: Anticipatory Strategies for Multicultural Problems and Intolerance in Indonesia." *Jurnal Antropologi: Isu-Isu Sosial Budaya* 22, no. 1 (May 31, 2020): 131–41. https://doi.org/10.25077/JANTRO.V22.N1.P131-141.2020.
- Gerring, John. "Qualitative Methods." *Annual Review of Political Science* 20 (May 11, 2017): 15–36. https://doi.org/10.1146/ANNUREV-POLISCI-092415-024158.
- Guilherme, Manuela, and Gunther Dietz. "Difference in Diversity: Multiple Perspectives on Multicultural, Intercultural, and Transcultural Conceptual Complexities." *Journal of Multicultural Discourses* 10, no. 1 (January 2, 2015): 1–21. https://doi.org/10.1080/17447143.2015.1015539.
- Hasan, Noorhaidi. "The Making of Public Islam: Piety, Agency, and Commodification on the Landscape of the Indonesian Public Sphere." *Contemporary Islam* 3, no. 3 (October 24, 2009): 229–50. https://doi.org/10.1007/S11562-009-0096-9.
- Hasanah, Karimatul. "Toward an Objective Islamic Studies." *Teosofia: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Mysticism* 5, no. 1 (June 19, 2016): 1–10. https://doi.org/10.21580/tos.v5i1.1713.
- Heeren, John. "Alfred Schutz and the Sociology of Common-Sense Knowledge." In *Everyday Life: Reconstruction of Social Knowledge*, 45–56. Taylor and Francis, 2017. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351327329-2.
- Hernandez, Hilda. *Multicultural Education: A Teacher's Guide to Linking Context Process, and Content.* Prentice Hall, 2001.
- Himawan, Eunike Mutiara, Annie Pohlman, and Winnifred Louis. "Revisiting the May 1998 Riots in Indonesia: Civilians and Their Untold Memories." *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs* 2022, no. 2 (March 9, 2022): 240–57. https://doi.org/10.1177/18681034221084320.
- Howard, Veena R. "Nonviolence in the Dharma Traditions: Hinduism, Jainism, and Buddhism." In *The Routledge Handbook of Pacifism and Nonviolence*, edited by Andrew Fiala, 1st ed., 80–92. Routledge, 2018. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315638751-8.
- Idris, Muh., Saidna Zulfiqar bin Tahir, Nasruddin Yusuf, Evra Willya, Sabil Mokodenseho, and Yusriadi Yusriadi. "The Implementation of Religious Moderation Values in Islamic Education and Character Subject at State Senior High School 9 Manado." *Academy of Strategic Management Journal* 20, no. 6 (2021): 1–16.
- Idris, Muh, Evra Willya, Ismail Suardi Wekke, and Sabil Mokodenseho. "Peace Resolution in Education and Application on Information and Communication Technologhy." *International Journal of Advanced Science and Technology* 29, no. 6 (2020): 3349–3358. http://sersc.org/journals/index.php/IJAST/article/view/14076.
- Islam, Muhammad Hifdil. "Diversity and Multicultural." *Humanistika* 3, no. 1 (2017): 83–103.
- Jackson, Robert. *Rethinking Religious Education and Plurality*. Routledge, 2013. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203465165.
- Jayadi, Karta, Amirullah Abduh, and Muhammad Basri. "A Meta-Analysis of Multicultural Education Paradigm in Indonesia." *Heliyon* 8, no. 1 (January 1, 2022): e08828. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.HELIYON.2022.E08828.
- Jinkins, Michael. Invitation to Theology: A Guide to Study, Conversation & Practice.

- InterVarsity Press, 2015.
- Kaawoan, Selviyanti. "The Role of Educators in Fostering Students' Tolerant Behavior at Public High School in Bolaang Mongondow Regency." *European Journal of Humanities and Educational Advancements (EJHEA)* 2, no. 12 (2021): 103–5.
- Kahn, Nicholas A. B. "Gastronomes of the Old School: American Iterations of the Cannibal Idea." In *Interdisciplinary Essays on Cannibalism*, edited by Giulia Champion, 1st ed., 230–49. New York: Routledge, 2021. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003002154-21.
- Keren, Arnon. "Trust, Preemption, and Knowledge." In *Trust in Epistemology*, 114–35. Taylor and Francis, 2019. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351264884-5.
- Kholil, Mohamad. "Multicultural Education According to Azyumardi Azra's Perspective." *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research* 05, no. 04 (April 29, 2022): 1518–22. https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v5-i4-43.
- King, Victor T. "A Sociological-Anthropological Gaze on Changing Perspectives on Southeast Asia: Personal Interventions in Discipline and Area." *Asia in Transition* 12 (2021): 75–90. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-2438-4_4.
- Klaasen, John S. "Diakonia and Diaconal Church." *Missionalia* 48, no. 1 (2020): 120–33. https://doi.org/10.7832/48-1-363.
- Knippenberg, Daan van, and Wendy P. van Ginkel. "A Diversity Mindset Perspective on Inclusive Leadership." *Group & Organization Management* 47, no. 4 (April 30, 2022): 779–97. https://doi.org/10.1177/1059601121997229.
- Lahmar, Fella, Khalid Arar, Dina Sijamhodži'c, and Sijamhodži'c-Nadarevi'c. "Contribution of Islamic Religious Education to Intercultural Values in Pluralistic European Cultures: Insights from Bosnia and Herzegovina." *Religions* 14, no. 4 (March 28, 2023): 453. https://doi.org/10.3390/REL14040453.
- Levrau, François, and Patrick Loobuyck. "Introduction: Mapping the Multiculturalism-Interculturalism Debate." *Comparative Migration Studies* 6, no. 1 (December 1, 2018): 13. https://doi.org/10.1186/S40878-018-0080-8.
- Limoreo Degaga, Tesfaye, Yilfashewa Seyoum Mekuria, and Università Degli Studi Di Bari Aldo. "Multicultural Education: Teachers' Perceptions in Hosanna College of Education, Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region (SNNPR), Ethiopia." *Cogent Education* 10, no. 1 (2023): 2184916. https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2023.2184916.
- Lipner, Julius. "The Truth of Dharma and the Dharma of Truth: Reflections on Hinduism as a Dharmic Faith." *International Journal of Hindu Studies* 23, no. 3 (December 7, 2019): 213–37. https://doi.org/10.1007/S11407-019-09262-3.
- Lo, Sarinah. "The Roles of Christian Schools in Mitigating Ethno-Religious Violence in Indonesia." *International Journal of Christianity & Education* 26, no. 3 (January 24, 2022): 300–314. https://doi.org/10.1177/20569971211064993.
- March, Andrew F. "Political Islam: Theory." *Annual Reviews* 18 (May 11, 2015): 103–23. https://doi.org/10.1146/ANNUREV-POLISCI-082112-141250.
- Merlin-Knoblich, Clare, Taryne M. Mingo, and Rachel Saunders. "An Exploration of School Counselor Small Group Work Experiences Leading Diversity Dinner Dialogues." *The Journal for Specialists in Group Work* 47, no. 2 (2022): 133–50. https://doi.org/10.1080/01933922.2021.1950878.
- Merlin-Knoblich, Clare, C. Missy Moore, and Merry Leigh Dameron. "Examining the Impact of a Diversity Dinner Dialogue Led by School Counselors on Student and Faculty Multicultural Attitudes." *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development* 51, no. 2 (April 1, 2023): 92–103. https://doi.org/10.1002/JMCD.12240.
- Miles, M. B., and A. M. Huberman. *Qualitative Data Analysis*. II. Newbury Park, CA.: SAGE Publications Inc., 1994.

- Mirski, Robert, and Mark H. Bickhard. "Conventional Minds: An Interactivist Perspective on Social Cognition and Its Enculturation." *New Ideas in Psychology* 62 (August 1, 2021): 100856. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.NEWIDEAPSYCH.2021.100856.
- Mokodenseho, Sabil. "Pendidikan Dan Politik: Gerakan Sarekat Islam Di Sulawesi Utara Periode 1920-1950." Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, 2020.
- ——. Sisi Lain Gerakan Sarekat Islam Di Sulawesi Utara Periode 1920-1950. Surabaya: Jakad Media Publishing, 2020.
- Mokodenseho, Sabil, and Ismail Suardi Wekke. "Toleransi Beragama Dan Pembelajaran Agama Islam: Harmoni Masyarakat Minoritas Muslim Manado." *Prosiding* 1, no. 1 (February 21, 2017): 67–75.
- Mokodenseho, Sabil, and Arif Zamhari. "The Struggle of Islam and Christianity in the Establishment of Educational Institutions in Bolaang Mongondow, North Sulawesi (1905-1942)." *ULUL ALBAB Jurnal Studi Islam* 22, no. 1 (July 8, 2021): 23–48. https://doi.org/10.18860/ua.v22i1.11760.
- Mukani, Mukani. "Islamic Religious Education Subject to Strengthen Harmonization in National Life: A Case at a Multicultural School." *Tadibia Islamika* 2, no. 1 (June 24, 2022): 11–22. https://doi.org/10.28918/TADIBIA.V2I1.5383.
- Naz, Muhammad Zaman, Abdur Rashid Qadri, and Farman Ali. "The Role of Religion in Establishing Peaceful Coexistence in Society." *Journal of Islamic Thought and Civilization* 8, no. 2 (October 2, 2018): 163–82. https://doi.org/10.32350/jitc.
- Nursikin, Mukh, Bambang Winardi, Ade Risna Sari, Sri Supiah Cahyati, and Andrew Shandy Utama. "Multicultural Based Islamic Religious Education In Indonesia." *At-Tarbiyat: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 5, no. 3 (2022): 468–75. https://doi.org/10.37758/JAT.V5I3.492.
- Pajarianto, Hadi, Imam Pribadi, and Puspa Sari. "Tolerance between Religions through the Role of Local Wisdom and Religious Moderation." *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies* 78, no. 4 (2022). https://doi.org/10.4102/HTS.V78I4.7043.
- Parsons, Talcott. "The Present Status of 'Structural-Functional' Theory in Sociology." In *The Idea of Social Structure: Papers in Honor of Robert K. Merton*, edited by Lewis A. Coser, 1st ed., 67–84. Routledge, 2017. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315132563-5.
- Pratt, Douglas, and Charles L. Tieszen. "Christians, Muslims and the True Religion." *Christian-Muslim Relations. A Bibliographical History Volume 15 Thematic Essays* (600-1600), April 17, 2020, 73–97. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004423701_005.
- Raihani, R. "Education for Multicultural Citizens in Indonesia: Policies and Practices." *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education* 48, no. 6 (November 2, 2017): 992–1009. https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2017.1399250.
- Ratts, Manivong J., Anneliese A. Singh, Sylvia Nassar-McMillan, S. Kent Butler, and Julian Rafferty McCullough. "Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competencies: Guidelines for the Counseling Profession." *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development* 44, no. 1 (January 2016): 28–48. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmcd.12035.
- Remiswal, Remiswal, Martin Kustati, Zulmuqim Zulmuqim, Mahyudin Ritonga, David D. Perrodin, and Arham Junaidi Firman. "Religious Education for Schools Within Conflict-Prone Zones: An Inclusive Multicultural Approach." *Journal of Innovation in Educational and Cultural Research* 3, no. 3 (May 11, 2022): 412–21. https://doi.org/10.46843/JIECR.V3I3.127.
- Rimkevičius, Paulius. "The Interpretive-Sensory Access Theory of Self-Knowledge: Empirical Adequacy and Scientific Fruitfulness." *Problemos*, no. 97 (2020): 150–63.
- Rodríguez, Ángel García. "A Wittgensteinian View of Mind and Self-Knowledge." *Philosophia (United States)* 48, no. 3 (July 1, 2020): 993–1013. https://doi.org/10.1007/S11406-019-00143-Y/METRICS.

- Saihu, Made, Nasaruddin Umar, Ahmad T. Raya, and Akhmad Shunhaji. "Multicultural Education Based on Religiosity to Enhance Social Harmonization within Students: A Study in a Public Senior High School." *Pegem Journal of Education and Instruction* 12, no. 3 (July 3, 2022): 265–74. https://doi.org/10.47750/PEGEGOG.12.03.28.
- Sharma, Gunjan, Radhika Mittal, and Zayan. "Teacher Education in India's National Education Policy 2020: Knowledge Traditions, Global Discourses and National Regulations." *Contemporary Education Dialogue*, June 26, 2023. https://doi.org/10.1177/09731849231168728.
- Silva, Daniela, and Sofia Marques da Silva. "Policies and Practices on Intercultural Education in Portuguese Schools." *Intercultural Education* 33, no. 5 (2022): 509–25. https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2022.2122173.
- Song, Sarah. "The Subject of Multiculturalism: Culture, Religion, Language, Ethnicity, Nationality, and Race?" In *New Waves in Political Philosophy*, 177–97. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK, 2009. https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230234994_10.
- Susanto, Heri. "Perception on Cultural Diversity and Multiculturalism Education." In Proceedings of the 1st International Conference on Social Sciences Education "Multicultural Transformation in Education, Social Sciences and Wetland Environment" (ICSSE 2017), 125–29. Atlantis Press, 2017. https://doi.org/10.2991/ICSSE-17.2018.30.
- Torres, Carlos Alberto, and Massimiliano Tarozzi. "Multiculturalism in the World System: Towards a Social Justice Model of Inter/Multicultural Education." *Globalisation, Societies and Education* 18, no. 1 (January 1, 2020): 7–18. https://doi.org/10.1080/14767724.2019.1690729.
- Wang, Ge, and Fang Gao. "The School-Based Multicultural Education Curriculum in China: A Case Study of Two Yugur Middle Schools." *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 2023, 1–13. https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2023.2166944.
- Wekke, I. S., & Mokodenseho, S. "Religious Teaching and Learning in Minority Muslim of Manado Indonesia." In *2nd International Conference on Education, Science, and Technology (ICEST 2017)*, edited by G. D. Dirawan, 187–89. Atlantis Press, 2017. https://doi.org/10.2991/icest-17.2017.62.
- Wekke, Ismail Suardi, Sabil Mokodenseho, and Firdaus Firdaus. "Religious Education and Tolerance: Learning Process in High School of Minority Muslim Indonesia," 2017. https://doi.org/10.31227/OSF.IO/KM79D.
- Wekke, Ismail Suardi, Sabil Mokodenseho, and A. Fadzlur Rahman. "Values of Religious Tolerance in Islamic Learning Material of Muslim Minority State High School," 2018. https://doi.org/10.31227/osf.io/tfbkc.
- Wong, Sarah Shi Hui. "Deliberate Erring Improves Far Transfer of Learning More Than Errorless Elaboration and Spotting and Correcting Others' Errors." *Educational Psychology Review* 35, no. 1 (February 7, 2023): 1–34. https://doi.org/10.1007/S10648-023-09739-Z.
- Zarbaliyev, Habib. "Multiculturalism in Globalization Era: History and Challenge for Indonesia." *Journal of Social Studies (JSS)* 13, no. 1 (November 21, 2017): 1–16. https://doi.org/10.21831/JSS.V13I1.16966.